

<u>CERTIFIED MAIL</u> RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Ruth Schulder 47 Crestwood St. West Orange, NJ 07052

JUL 1 2 2002 11

RE: MUR 5279

Bill Bradley for President, Inc.

Dear Ms. Schulder:

On June 26, 2002, the Federal Election Commission found that there is reason to believe you violated 2 U.S.C. § 441f and 11 C.F.R. § 110.4(b)(1)(iv), provisions of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended ("the Act") and Commission regulations. The Factual and Legal Analysis, which formed a basis for the Commission's finding, is attached for your information.

You may submit any factual or legal materials that you believe are relevant to the Commission's consideration of this matter. Please submit such materials to the General Counsel's Office within 15 days of your receipt of this letter. In addition, please complete and return the enclosed questionnaire within 15 days. Where appropriate, statements should be submitted under oath. In the absence of additional information, the Commission may find probable cause to believe that a violation has occurred and proceed with conciliation.

If you are interested in pursuing pre-probable cause conciliation, you should so request in writing. See 11 C.F.R. § 111.18(d). Upon receipt of the request, the Office of the General Counsel will make recommendations to the Commission either proposing an agreement in settlement of the matter or recommending declining that pre-probable cause conciliation be pursued. The Office of the General Counsel may recommend that pre-probable cause conciliation not be entered into at this time so that it may complete its investigation of the matter. Further, the Commission will not entertain requests for pre-probable cause conciliation after briefs on probable cause have been mailed to the respondent.

Requests for extensions of time will not be routinely granted. Requests must be made in writing at least five days prior to the due date of the response and specific good cause must be demonstrated. In addition, the Office of the General Counsel ordinarily will not give extensions beyond 20 days.

If you intend to be represented by counsel in this matter, please advise the Commission by completing the enclosed form stating the name, address, and telephone number of such counsel, and authorizing such counsel to receive any notifications and other communications from the Commission.

This matter will remain confidential in accordance with 2 U.S.C. §§ 437g(a)(4)(B) and 437g(a)(12)(A), unless you notify the Commission in writing that you wish the investigation to be made public.

For your information, we have enclosed a brief description of the Commission's procedures for handling possible violations of the Act. If you have any questions, please contact Albert Veldhuyzen or Michelle E. Abellera, the attorneys assigned to this matter, at (202) 694-1650.

Sincerely,

Karl J. Sandstrom Vice Chairman

Enclosures
Factual and Legal Analysis
Procedures
Designation of Counsel Form
Questionnaire

FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS

RESPONDENT:

Ruth Schulder

MUR: 5279

I. GENERATION OF MATTER

This matter was generated by an audit of Bradley for President, Inc. ("Committee") and Theodore V. Wells, as treasurer, undertaken in accordance with 26 U.S.C. § 9038(a).

II. FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS

A. Law

The Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended (the "Act"), provides that no person shall make a contribution in the name of another person or knowingly permit his name to be used to effect such a contribution, and no person shall knowingly accept a contribution made by one person in the name of another. 2 U.S.C. § 441f. See also 11 C.F.R. § 110.4(b)(1).

B. Contribution in the Name of Another

The Committee received 40 business checks totaling \$40,000 on June 22, 1999. The checks were written on the accounts of 40 different business entities and attributed to 39 individuals. A contribution schedule provided by the Committee listed all the contributors as partners in various "partnerships;" the schedule listed the names of the partnerships, the contributing partner and the address of the partnership. All of the partnerships have the same address: 26 Columbia Turnpike, Florham Park, NJ. This address is the corporate headquarters of Kushner Companies, a business owned and chaired by Charles Kushner. Elmwood V. Associates has been identified as a managing residential property held by Kushner Companies.

Dun and Bradstreet reports indicate that Kushner Companies is involved in approximately 100 locations. These properties appear to be managed by partnerships or limited liability companies in which Kushner Companies is the general partner.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

One of the contributions (check #5257 written for \$1,000) was attributed to Ms. Schulder

- as a partner of Elmwood V. Associates. However, there is no evidence to confirm that Ms.
- 3 Schulder is a partner in Elmwood V. Associates or that Ms. Schulder's individual partnership
- 4 account was charged.² The Commission attempted to verify the status of Elmwood V.
- 5 Associates through Dun and Bradstreet and the New Jersey Secretary of State. There was no
- 6 evidence that Ms. Schulder was a "partner" of Elmwood V. Associates. However, research by
- 7 this office revealed that Ms. Schulder is a relative of Mr. Kushner.

An examination of all 40 contribution checks indicates that they were mass-produced and originated from a single corporate source. The accountholder's name, bank routing numbers and other notations all appear to be printed in the same type as the payee and amount information.

All but three checks contained the same typographical error. The fundraiser's name, Sapoch, was spelled incorrectly in the payee line ("Japoch"). All of the checks were drawn on accounts held at two different banks, Norcrown Bank and Valley National Bank. Norcrown Bank is part of the Kushner group of businesses. Lastly, all the checks appear to have been signed by the same person. Although not legible, the signatures on the checks appear very consistent. Given the likelihood that the checks were signed by Mr. Kushner and originated from Kushner Companies and given the absence of evidence that the partners of the various partnerships intended to make

Kushner were the true source of the contributions.

contributions, the Office of General Counsel believes that Kushner Companies and/or Mr.

[•]

The Committee sent follow-up letters to determine the eligibility of the contributions for matching funds. Only 4 of the 39 contributors replied to the Committee's request for verification. Ms. Schulder did not reply.

A comparison of the check signatures with Mr. Kushner's signature as displayed on the Kushner Companies' website suggests that the signatures may have originated from the same person.

Factual and Legal Analysis—MUR 5279 Ruth Schulder Page 3

2 U.S.C. § 441f and 11 C.F.R. § 110.4(b)(1)(iv).

Given Kushner Companies and Mr. Kushner's control over Elmwood V. Associates and other partnerships, Mr. Kushner's relation to Ms. Schulder and other named contributors, and the fact that the contributions appear to be signed by the same individual, were written for the same amount, and delivered on the same day, it is likely that contributions were made in the name of another. Furthermore, Ms. Schulder made contributions to other federal campaign committees under similar circumstances. The presence of this bundling pattern of contributions suggests that Ms. Schulder may have allowed her name to be used to effect contributions in the name of another. Accordingly, the Commission found reason to believe that Ruth Schulder violated



Questionnaire in Matter Under Review 5279 Ruth Schulder

Questionnaire Instructions

Pursuant to 2 U.S.C. § 437g, the Federal Election Commission is investigating contributions to the Bill Bradley for President, Inc. ("Bradley Committee") during the 2000 presidential primary election campaign. The Commission has obtained documents that appear to show that you made a \$1,000 partnership contribution to the Bradley Committee on June 16, 1999 by check number 5257. A copy of check number 5257 is attached for your review.

Please answer the following questions by checking the appropriate boxes or filling in the blank lines. Please review your answers to ensure they are accurate and complete. For all questions that call for a description or explanation, attach additional sheets if necessary. Please submit the questionnaire to the General Counsel's Office within 15 days of receipt.

Plea	ase provide your	employer's a	ddress.		
		000 partnersh	ip contributio	on to the Bra	adley Committee with check
		Yes			No
Dic	d you consent to t	he \$1,000 pa	rtnership con	tribution?	
		Yes		. 🗆	No
a.	When did you co	nsent to the	\$1,000 partner	rship contril	bution?
		11.70.2			
b.	How did you con	nsent to the S	S1,000 partner	ship contrib	oution?
			<u> </u>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	Did nur Did	Did you make a \$1,0 number 5257? Did you consent to t a. When did you co	Did you make a \$1,000 partnersh number 5257? Yes Did you consent to the \$1,000 partnersh number 5257? Yes A Yes	number 5257? Yes Did you consent to the \$1,000 partnership con Yes a. When did you consent to the \$1,000 partnership	Did you make a \$1,000 partnership contribution to the Branumber 5257? Yes Did you consent to the \$1,000 partnership contribution?

c.	Who did you cor	nmunicate your consent to		
d.	Did anyone ackn	nowledge your consent? P		•
e.		consent acknowledged?		
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Ar	e you a partner of	Elmwood V. Associates?	•	
		Yes		No
	hat is your partne mwood V. Assoc	rship status? Are you a liniates?	nited partner	or a general partner of
		Limited Partner		General Partner
Ple	ease describe the	structure and status of Elr	nwood V. A	ssociates:
a.	How many limi	ted partners does Elmwoo	d V. Associa	ates have?
b.	Please list the li	mited partners of Elmwoo	od V. Associ	ates.
c.	Please list the g	eneral partners of Elmwo	od V. Assoc	iates.

u.	When was Elmwood V. Associates created?
e.	What is the relationship between Elmwood V. Associates and Kushner Companies?
9. Ple	ease describe your involvement and participation in Elmwood V. Associates:
a.	When did you become a partner of Elmwood V. Associates?
b.	What was the percentage of your ownership interest when you joined Elmwood V. Associates?
c.	What was the percentage of your ownership interest in Elmwood V. Associates on June 16, 1999?
d.	What is the percentage of your current ownership interest in Elmwood V. Associates

g. Are you an officer of Elmwood V. Associates? Yes	f. Are you en	nployed	by Elmwood V. Associates?	•	
h. Please describe your job title(s) and responsibilities as an employee or officer of Elmwood V. Associates? 0. How did you submit your \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 to the Brace Committee? 1. Did you authorize the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 to the Bradley Committee? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a bank account that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originat			Yes		No
h. Please describe your job title(s) and responsibilities as an employee or officer of Elmwood V. Associates?	g. Are you ar	n office	of Elmwood V. Associates?		
Elmwood V. Associates?			Yes		No
1. Did you authorize the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 to the Bradley Committee? Yes No 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a bank account that you control? Yes No 3. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? Yes No 4. Please attach documentation showing that your bank account was debited or your personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men				lities as	an employee or officer of
1. Did you authorize the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 to the Bradley Committee? Yes No 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a bank account that you control? Yes No 3. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? Yes No 4. Please attach documentation showing that your bank account was debited or your personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men			1		
Committee? Yes	-	submit	your \$1,000 contribution wit	h check	number 5257 to the Bradley
Committee? Yes					
Committee? Yes					
 ☐ Yes ☐ No 2. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a bank account that you control? ☐ Yes ☐ No 3. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? ☐ Yes ☐ No 4. Please attach documentation showing that your bank account was debited or your personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men ☐ Yes ☐ No 	-	orize th	e \$1,000 contribution with ch	neck nur	mber 5257 to the Bradley
bank account that you control? Yes	CC		Yes		No
 3. Did funds for the \$1,000 contribution with check number 5257 originate from a personal partnership interest that you control? Yes No No No Please attach documentation showing that your bank account was debited or your personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men 				number	5257 originate from a
personal partnership interest that you control? ☐ Yes ☐ No 4. Please attach documentation showing that your bank account was debited or your personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men ☐ Yes ☐ No			Yes		No
 Yes □ No 4. Please attach documentation showing that your bank account was debited or your personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men □ Yes □ No 				numbe	er 5257 originate from a
personal partnership interest was charged. 5. a. Does Elmwood V. Associates organize a political contribution plan for its men Yes No	personai parti				No
□ Yes □ No				ank acco	ount was debited or your
	5. a. Does Elm	wood V	/. Associates organize a polit	ical con	tribution plan for its members
b. Please describe the contribution plan.			Yes	□ ·	No
	b. Please de	scribe t	he contribution plan.		

Questionnaire- MUR 5279 Ruth Schulder Page 5

		ease describe in fi Bradley Commit	_	on's involve	ment in the n	naking	of your contribution to
3.		Did anyone assocontribution to the		ilmwood V.		ncoura	ge you to make a
			Yes			No	
	b.	Please list the inc	lividuals and				
9.	a.	Did anyone asso contribution to th			ipanies enco	urage y	you to make a
	b.	Please list the in	dividuals and	d describe th	e circumstan	ces.	
).	A	re you a member	of any other	partnerships'	?		
			Yes		. 0	No	(If you answered "no please proceed to question 34.)

	maire- MUR 5279 nulder				
22.	How long have you	ı been a membe	r of those partners	hips?	
23.	What is your owner	rship interest in	each partnership?		*
	What is the relation Kushner Companies		nose other partners	ships to wh	nich you belong and
	·				
25.	Have you made conpartnerships?	ntributions to fe	deral committees	as a partne	r of these other
		Yes	Ī	□ No	(If you answered "n please proceed to question 34.)
26.	On a separate sheet partnerships. Pleas				partner of other
	Committee:		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	Partnership:	····	Da	ate:	Amount:
27.	a. Do the partnersh	nips organize po	litical contributio	n plans for	its members?
		Yes		□ No	(If you answered "n please proceed to question 30.)

b. Please describe the contribution plan.

Questionnaire- MUR 5279 Ruth Schulder Page 7

28.	As a partner, did you	agree to make	e political contr	ibutions	throu	igh a plan?
		Yes			No.	(If you answered "no," please proceed to question 30.)
29.	When did you agree	to participate	in such a plan?	·		
	For each of the abov to the respective com		s, please indicat	te how y	ou su	bmitted the contributions
31.	Please list all other p committees. Please i	ersons involv nclude comm	ed in your maki ittee personnel v	ng cont who rec	ributio eived	ons to other federal your contribution.
32.	a. Did anyone assoc to the federal com		partnerships en	courage	you t	to make contributions
		Yes			No	
	b. Please list the ind	ividuals and d	escribe the circ	umstano	es.	
			-			
33.	a. Did anyone assoc to the federal com		shner Companie	es encou	ırage y	ou to make contributions
		Yes			No	
	b. Please list the inc	dividuals and	describe the circ	cumstan	ces.	
	•					

34.		ursements or i	•	equence o	f your contribution	•
		Yes			No	
	b. Please list the i	ndividuals and	d describe the ci	rcumstanc	ces.	
35.	What is your relat	tionship to Ku	ishner Companie	es?		
				·		
36.	Have you ever be	en employed l	by Kushner Con	npanies?		
		Yes			No	
37.	Please provide the	e length of yo	ur employment	or associa	tion with Kushner	Companies.
38.	Please describe at Kushner Compani soliciting contribu collecting and for discussions and fu collecting and for	es and associations; suggest warding contrinctions relate	ated partnership ting or requestin ibutions. "Fundi d to other event	s. "Fundrage that a corraising act	aising activity" incontribution be mad ivity" also include	cludes le; making, es meetings,

Questionnaire- MUR 5279 Ruth Schulder Page 9

·	on the	day of	, 2002.
	Signature:	<u> </u>	
	Date:		
	•		
the best time during no	with you by telephone. Formal business hours for unber:	s to call.	phone number and tell us

Mail to all federal agencies in Washington, DC is irradiated against anthrax and other biological hazards. This has resulted in substantial delays in delivery. For this reason, we ask that you also fax a copy of your response to us at (202) 219-1043 or scan it and email it to Albert Veldhuyzen at aveldhuyzen@fec.gov.

If you have any questions, you may call the FEC attorneys assigned to this matter, Albert Veldhuyzen and Michelle Abellera, at (202) 694-1650 or (800) 424-9530.

THANK YOU FOR YOUR ASSISTANCE.

THE REPORT OF THE PARTY OF THE

55-138/212 CHECK NO. 5257	AMOUNT \$****1,000.00		REALTY CORP	SIGNATURE
ELMWOOD V. ASSOCIATES LP, VALLEY NATIONAL BANK 26 COLUMBIA TURNPIKE 73 S. LIVINGSTON AVE FLORHAM PARK NJ 07932 LIVINGSTON, NJ 07039	DATE 06/16/99	PAY EXACTLY ONE THOUSAND DOLLARS AND NO CENTS	BILL BRADLEY PRES EXPL COMMITT ELMWOOD V. REALTY TO C/O BETTY W. JAPOCH TO 4 HAWTHORNE AVENUE	ORDER PRINCETON NJ 08540

一般機関の の神 の